Society of Antiquaries
of **Scotland**

National Museums Scotland
Chambers Street
Edinburgh
EH1 1JF

Scottish Charity No. SC 010440

Scottish Funding Council
Apex 2
97 Haymarket Terrace
Edinburgh
EH12 5HD

reviewsecretariat@sfc.ac.uk

10 August 2020

Dear Review Secretariat

CALL FOR EVIDENCE: A REVIEW OF COHERENT PROVISION AND
SUSTAINABILITY IN FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Many thanks for giving the Society an opportunity to respond to this consultation.
Details about the Society are available on our website (www.socantscot.org), we are a
Learned Society established in 1780 and governed by Royal Charter since 1783. The
Society is particularly interested in the education and research of Scotland's past, and
as such welcomes this review and will engage positively with it.

As an independent charitable body we can offer our services as a place to host
discussions across the heritage/history/archaeology sectors/disciplines, and wider if
required. We advocate clarity and transparency in the review process both within and
outwith the tertiary education sector – ensuring clarity of communication with the
wider public is crucial if the review and its outcomes are to be supported and
efficiently implemented.

We have only limited specific comment on the questions proposed by the review due
to time restraints and have kept this as succinct as possible. We are happy to continue
these conversations at a future date.

a) *What do you think works well in the current further and higher education*
arrangements that we should keep in order to secure Scotland's inclusive
social and economic recovery from the current pandemic? How can we best
preserve and strengthen those features of education, research and innovation
in Scotland that we most prize, in a very challenging funding environment?

The historic environment sector contributed in excess of £4.2bn and c.66,000 FTE
jobs to the Scottish economy in 2017 (https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-
and-support/planning-and-guidance/scotland-s-historic-environment-audit/); in
addition a recent assessment of archaeology in development management across the
UK highlighted that Commercial Archaeology makes a £218m direct contribution to
the economy, for every £1 spent on Local Authority Planning Archaeology £15 is

telephone
• general enquiries 0131 247 4133 • director 0131 247 4115 • **facsimile** 0131 247 4163
• finance 0131 247 4135 • publications 0131 247 4145 • **website** www.socantscot.org • **email** info@socantscot.org

returned, 5,000 (74%) archaeologists are employed because of the developmental management system, archaeological work provides up to an estimated £1.3bn in savings to construction industry through reduced delay costs in 2017-18 alone and Local Authority based archaeological services are worth up to £245m in savings to public purse in 2017-18 (https://landward.eu/blog/archaeology-in-development-management/). Further studies have highlighted the other benefits of heritage and the historic environment to society in general where it enhances lives (e.g. those who visited a historic site were over 50% more likely to report a high life satisfaction https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/planning-and-guidance/scotland-s-historic-environment-audit/; visiting heritage sites is estimated to save the NHS over £193.2 million by reducing demand for GP visits and psychotherapy https://historicengland.org.uk/research/heritage-counts/heritage-and-society/). Further evidence can be provided if required.

Much, if not all, of this is underpinned by expertise and skills gained through tertiary education since currently a university education is the main route to employment in the heritage sector (for example through history of various types or archaeology). Archaeology and history are considered to have a wide range of transferable skills that provide for positive destinations for students (see evidence below). Vocational training is a key part of the toolkit for educating the next generation of archaeologists and historians.

The Society supports the role of university museums which not only provide research materials for the universities themselves but also for researchers based outwith host institutions, increasing collaboration and public engagement. In addition to archaeology collections, they include many other collections relevant to Scottish history: "Scottish universities hold diverse and immensely rich collections of more than 1.8 million items. They comprise 32% of the country's materials on history of science, 31% of the nation's coins and medals, 24% of its fine art, 20% of natural science collections and 18% of its world culture collections. Collections in five universities, including the entire holdings of the Universities of Aberdeen and Glasgow, have been Recognised as nationally significant." (University Museums in Scotland https://www.umis.ac.uk/)

Much excellent research is undertaken in Scottish universities to better understand Scotland's past (and of course wider global pasts), a single archaeological example focused on Scotland is provided here for evidence – that of the University of Aberdeen archaeology department into the Early Historic period in Scotland and further afield; specific projects include the Leverhulme Trust funded "Comparative Kingship: the early medieval Kingdoms of Northern Britain and Ireland" the AHRC funded "The Bennachie Landscape Project: Community Connections in the North-East of Scotland" and the "Northern Picts Project".

Both the museums sector in Scotland and the wider historic environment sector have national peer and government agreed strategies (*Going Further* - https://www.museumsgalleriesscotland.org.uk/media/1094/going-further-the-national-strategy-for-museums-and-galleries-in-scotland.pdf and *Our Place in Time* – https://www.gov.scot/publications/place-time-historic-environment-strategy-scotland/ respectively) with a further national Archaeology Strategy (http://archaeologystrategy.scot/) that all highlight the need for innovation in

education and practice and provide frameworks for helping to further review and develop the tertiary education system with regard to Scotland's past.

The outcomes of this review should ensure that we secure these positive social and economic benefits of teaching, research and the resources required to undertake education at tertiary level of the historic environment/heritage.

b) *What do you think colleges, universities and specialist institutions should stop doing, or do differently, in order to contribute effectively to an inclusive social and economic recovery? (You may wish to comment on teaching and skills development, sectoral and employer needs and employability, research, innovation and knowledge exchange, widening access and equalities issues.)*

There are various challenges in tertiary education as it applies to our understanding of Scotland's past and the above accrued examples of benefits, and a more collaborative approach across different tertiary education institutions across Scotland could help to mitigate several of these.

For example, archaeology is a field-based subject, with vital elements of science-based teaching and laboratory requirements, cognate with those in physical geography and earth, marine and environmental sciences. Archaeology requires equipment for teaching in the field (geophysics, GPS, laser and aerial survey, excavation equipment); laboratories and staff for post-excavation analysis (chemicals and appropriate stores, use of, or access to, isotopic analysis, DNA analysis, X-Ray Fluorescence spectrometry, Scanning Electron Microscopy, radiocarbon and other dating techniques); practical class based teaching handling material remains from site excavations. Other teaching materials include computing resources associated with Geographic Information Systems (GIS), 3-D modelling, statistical analysis and so on. The provision of these resources could be provided across Scotland through the tertiary education system on a collaborative basis.

In another example, archaeology has a lack of diversity across the industry, and this means that Scotland's past is viewed from a relatively narrow perspective. Universities are improving the diversity of their intake, but it is recognised that university is not a preferred option for everyone and colleges enrol a much higher proportion of students from more deprived backgrounds (Commissioner for fair Access, 2017, 7). The intake of archaeological undergraduates to university is limited (see Application Statistics below) and many who are interested in this subject may not be able to pursue it within a university due to the time or financial commitment. Universities report oversubscription for courses (see Application Statistics below) and a very positive end destination generally (see Outcome Statistics below), albeit there are no statistics on how many enter the archaeology profession specifically or other professions. This data reflects the interest and appetite to learn about archaeology and the applicability of archaeological research as an employable skill set.

One of the obvious ways to address these challenges for archaeology is a closer collaboration between university and college provision, melding vocational courses in appropriate institutions. This has led the Society to consider the wider provision of tertiary education across the various providers and begin to reconsider the models of heritage education provision in Scotland. As part of this, the Society, with heritage

industry colleagues, are already working on introducing college courses to the education pathways available to all school leavers, and this review is an opportunity to take these considerations further.

c) *How can colleges, universities and specialist institutions best support Scotland's international connectedness and competiveness in the postpandemic, post-EU membership environment?*

Heritage education provision is not restricted to understanding Scotland's past and world class major international research projects are hosted in Scottish universities. In addition, Scotland's heritage resource (both our assets and infrastructure) is itself a draw for international research and students taught at Scottish institutions are employed and sought after across the globe for their skills and expertise.

Indeed, Scotland's past cannot be viewed or understood in isolation, and this provision across tertiary education institutions can be further developed.

d) *What opportunities and threats does the post-pandemic environment hold for colleges, universities and specialist institutions? For institutional leaders, how are you planning to address these challenges and opportunities?*

It seems clear that one of the main threats to tertiary education will be financial as fewer international and local students might apply to Scottish institutions due to the pandemic. It could also be that for various reasons applications to tertiary education reduce from students with deprived backgrounds. This in turn might place some areas of course provision under at least perceived threat. The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland is clear that both history and archaeology should not be considered an expendable education provision, since both are critical to understanding our present place in the world and are crucial to a sustainable industry working to deliver key government goals.

There is a serious risk that already stretched university museum budgets and staff will be cut if university fee income falls next year – on top of which they are very exposed to a cut in the annual grant by the SFC as it is a three year scheme 2018-2021 that is now due for review.

The SFC £1.2million annual grant goes to university museums in Aberdeen, Dundee, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Glasgow School of Art, Heriot Watt, Robert Gordon, St Andrews, Stirling to "alleviate the financial burden of caring for the collections, gives them a higher profile within their institution, and allows them to be more outwardly focused on research, teaching and public engagement activities." Key outcomes are:
• Caring for internationally important collections
• Providing research access beyond the needs of each institution
• Supporting teaching and learning for the wider HE community.
• Enabling widening access, community engagement and outreach.

The current review provides an opportunity to develop and deliver a new route or routes to employment and a career in archaeology that will meet industry needs, take advantage of the drive for increased apprenticeships in Scotland to help deliver on the Scottish Government Youth Employment Strategy (Developing the Young Workforce

2014) and build on the work being undertaken for other heritage industries (conservation courses delivered in partnership between HES, Stirling University and Forth Valley College). This will also help deliver the sector investment plan for the historic environment developed by Skills Development Scotland and Historic Environment Scotland (https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=15425b9a-e46d-44fd-9b19-aa1b00c3e981).

e) *What forms of collaboration within the tertiary education eco-system would best enable a coherent and effective response to these challenges and opportunities?*

The Society is keen to explore all the possible forms of collaboration both between universities and between different tertiary educators to deliver better outcomes for students of all levels, and for the heritage sector/industry and the public (for example through a broader view of Scotland's past).

f) *How can SFC, alongside government and other enterprise, skills and education-focused agencies, best support colleges, universities and specialist institutions to make their full contribution to Scotland's inclusive, green and education-led recovery? In particular, you may wish to draw out:*
• How scarce public resources should be prioritised to drive recovery
• Particular areas of collaboration between agencies that would best support the sectors' contributions
• Adaptations to SFC's funding and accountability frameworks to promote agile and collaborative action by the sectors to build Scotland's recovery
• How SFC's funding and accountability frameworks should ensure that equality and wide access to educational opportunity are promoted as key elements of the recovery for younger people and adults
• What support SFC and government could give institutions to adapt to a changed environment

The opportunity in this review lies in the potential to identify the challenges and opportunities afforded by the current educational eco-system. For the Society this obviously focuses on the heritage sector, and the potential to create new and flexible routes to employment for people of all backgrounds, addressing the needs of industry and providing opportunities to develop an increasingly diverse workforce. Such a change in the education of historians and archaeologists for example would promote heritage as a career in itself (in various guises) and as a vehicle offering a set of widely transferrable skills that can be used in other employment settings and provide key foundations for other career opportunities.

As an example of the thinking currently being undertaken by the heritage sector I include in an appendix to this response information used to spark the development of college courses in archaeology (some of this has been repeated above in appropriate locations, but it includes further evidence as to the need for a change in the tertiary teaching of archaeology).

One of the central tenets of the heritage sector's vision for the historic environment, articulated through *Our Place in Time* and *Scotland's Archaeology Strategy*, is to remove conceptual silos that are detrimental to delivering better outcomes and improve innovation across the sector, this review is an opportunity to challenge such silo thinking and improve innovation in Scotland at the point of education.

I hope that this response will help to ensure that the heritage sector is directly involved in this wider strategic review of tertiary education, if you have any further queries please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely,

Dr Simon Gilmour
Director (director@socantscot.org)

Name: Dr Simon Gilmour

Contact details: Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, Chambers Street, Edinburgh EH1 1JF, director@socantscot.org, 07799691981

Are you responding officially on behalf of an organisation or as an individual?:
Yes an organisation – Society of Antiquaries of Scotland

I give my consent for my response to be published.

APPENDIX
People, currently, become archaeologists through a University education. There are only a very few cases in Scotland where archaeologists have been employed without University education of some sort. The archaeology sector encompasses a wide range of employment locations, including commercial companies of varying size operating mainly in a development-led environment, public body organisations including regulators, infrastructure development, universities and museums, third sector charitable organisations and Local Authorities, all operating in national and/or local environments. This broad range of work environments represents the archaeological "industry". The most recent work-force survey in 2017 recognised 4,351 people were working in UK applied, commercial archaeology in 2016-17. The net number of people working in professional archaeology in the UK growing by 8.7% in financial year 2016-17 to an estimated total of 6,253 individuals. This figure combines the numbers working in applied, commercial archaeology, curatorial archaeology (archaeologists advising local planning authorities) and all other areas of archaeological employment (Landward Research Ltd, 2017, 5).

There is a significant body of evidence that the industry has a series of employment challenges, focused on both skills gaps in areas required to undertake archaeological

research (Cara Jones CIfA report), and also on the challenge of major infrastructure development (such as the dualling of the A9 in Scotland, new runway construction in London, and HS2and HS3) where there is concern that there will not be adequate numbers of archaeologists to service these needs (Hook 2016). To ensure these planning led pressures can be accommodated without detrimental impact is a highly time-sensitive issue. The Federation of Archaeological Managers and Employers (FAME) stated in April 2018 "Wages are improving, together with working conditions and training opportunities. And there are plenty of jobs on offer. FAME members are looking to employ more staff than ever before and they recognise the importance of getting the right people and the benefits of developing and retaining skilled staff." These specific issues are further compounded by an aging workforce, which is losing skills and expertise and lacks the opportunities to pass on these abilities and experience to the next generation of the workforce. *Scotland's Archaeology Strategy Aim 5: Innovation and Skills* seeks to address all these challenges (2015 see refs) and *Our Place in Time* (*OPiT*) recognises, "…skills and capacity at all levels that are needed to manage, nurture and enjoy the historic environment across all our communities" is a cross-cutting priority with a clear focus on capacity building (*OPiT* page 10). This proposal builds on the *OPiT* commitment to "realising the benefits of joined-up working across the sector for government education priorities including skills, employability and training" (*OPiT* page 11).

Skills development is a recognised issue, with some employers resorting to developing their own in-house training, and there is also widespread uptake of the BAJR Skills Passport that has been independently developed recently. However, there are no formal industry-wide training benchmarks or provisions for quality assessment. Employers continue to be supportive of the Level 3 NVQ Certificate in Archaeological Practice, and many would be interested in supporting Apprenticeships in Historic Environment Practice should one be created (Landward Research Ltd, 2017, 6). 50% of employers report a loss of fieldwork skills, and 58% a loss of desk-based or environmental assessment skills (op. cit., 44), and these are therefore key areas to target.

Archaeology has a lack of diversity across the industry, and this means that Scotland's past is viewed from a relatively narrow perspective. Universities are improving the diversity of their intake, but it is recognised that university is not a preferred option for everyone and colleges enrol a much higher proportion of students from more deprived backgrounds (Commissioner for fair Access, 2017, 7). The intake of archaeological undergraduates to university is limited (see Application Statistics below) and many who are interested in this subject may not be able to pursue it within a university due to the time or financial commitment. Universities report oversubscription for courses (see Application Statistics below) and a very positive end destination generally (see Outcome Statistics below), albeit there are no statistics on how many enter the archaeology profession or other professions. This data reflects the interest and appetite to learn about archaeology and the applicability of archaeological research as an employable skill set.

Delivering a new route or routes to employment and a career in archaeology will meet industry needs, take advantage of the drive for increased apprenticeships in Scotland to help deliver on the Scottish Government Youth Employment Strategy (Developing the Young Workforce 2014) and build on the work being undertaken elsewhere

(development of apprenticeships in England) and for other heritage industries (conservation courses delivered in partnership between HES, Stirling University and Forth Valley College). This will also help deliver the sector investment plan for the historic environment being developed by Skills Development Scotland and Historic Environment Scotland (e.g. Turner 2018).

There is a recognised reluctance to introduce young people to archaeology at school, this is being addressed by work such as that in Strathclyde University and Archaeology Scotland, introducing archaeology to teacher training. Archaeology as a career is being introduced through Young Archaeology Clubs, lectures/presentation/workshop/outreach by archaeologists in schools and other environments. The realisation of a Chartered professional institute and the development of Chartered Archaeologist status will put the career on the same footing as engineering, architecture and so on. The abandonment of the archaeology A level however, removes an early introduction to archaeology and a potential platform for career development.

The new employment routes proposed are industry focused and developed for the 21st century.

University Application Statistics
Application statistics are published for archaeology as a subject by relatively few universities, those that do show a consistent pattern of oversubscription and low intake numbers. Combined with the outcome statistics published by *Unistats* (see below) these indicate very low numbers entering archaeology as a profession relative to the industry agreed need.

Cambridge University:
2017 56 applications, 36 offers, 26 accepted
2018 51 applications, 33 offers

Oxford University:
2015: 93 applications, 30 offers, 27 accepted
2016: 97 applications, 24 offers, 18 accepted

Edinburgh University:
2015 77 applications, 42 offers, 14 accepted
2016 125 applications, 43 offers, 13 accepted
2017 146 applications, 55 offers, 21 accepted

University Outcome Statistics
From *Unistats*, the official website for comparing UK higher education course data: https://unistats.ac.uk/Search/SubjectList/091/ReturnTo/Subjects/ByGroup

Comparing the first degree archaeology only courses (no joint courses) between the main offering institutions (Aberdeen, Edinburgh, Glasgow and UHI) provides the following information:

Average salary 6 months after course – between £18,000 and £20,000
Go on to work and/or study after the course – between 80% and 90%

Go on to work – 30%-40% with Uni of Edinburgh at 75% and UHI part-time at 70%

Employment after 6 months after the course:
UHI BA(Hons) Arch part-time - 60% in professional or managerial job and 40% in another type of job
UHI BA(Hons) Arch full-time - 25% in professional or managerial job and 75% in another type of job
Aberdeen BSc(Hons) Arch full-time - 55% in professional or managerial job and 45% in another type of job
Aberdeen MA(Hons) Arch full-time - 55% in professional or managerial job and 45% in another type of job
Edinburgh MA(Hons) Arch full-time - 30% in professional or managerial job and 70% in another type of job
Glasgow BSc(Hons) Arch full-time – no info

No archaeology courses offered by universities in Scotland are additionally accredited by any related professional body.